Capacity of Local Government Units (LGU) to Manage COVID-19 Positive Locally Stranded Individuals (LSI) in the Context of Procurement Data

Project Title: Understanding resiliency of provinces and municipalities in the context of COVID-19 related tenders using an operations research methodology

Principal Investigator: Engr. John Raymond Barajas



Open Contracting: Procurement Analytics Research Grant for 2020 Grant Contract Number: PHOC620-00177 July 20, 2020, 1:00 PM – 2:00 PM





RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

CONCLUSION 2

BACKGROUND

METHODOLOGY



BACKGROUND

METHODOLOGY

Possible Cause of Recent Spike in COVID-19 Cases [2]



Republic of the Philippines DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH CENTER FOR HEALTH DEVELOPMENT - BICOL

Bicol records 9 new cases of COVID-19 Press Release, July 16, 2020

The Department of Health Center for Health Development (DOH CHD) – Bicol records nine (9) new confirmed cases of COVID-19. The total number of COVID-19 cases recorded in Bicol Region is now two hundred fortyfour (244). Active cases are one hundred thirty-two (132).

On the 9 new cases, two (2) are from Aroroy, one (1) from Legazpi City, one (1) from Tabaco City, one (1) from Manito, one (1) from Oas, one (1) from Naga City, one (1) from Bagamanoc and one (1) from Matnog.

- Bicol#236 a 25-year old Filipino male from Aroroy, Masbate. He arrived from Tarlae on June 20, 2020. He is asymptomatic and is quarantined at an LGU quarantine facility.
- Bicol#237 a 5-year old Filipino male from Aroroy, Masbate. He arrived from Bulacan on June 21, 2020. He is asymptomatic and is quarantined at an LGU quarantine facility.
- Bicol#238 a 51-year old Filipino male from Matnog, Sorsogon. He arrived from Makati City on July 7, 2020. He first experienced symptoms on July 12, 2020. He is quarantined at an LGU quarantine facility.
- Bicol#239 –a 24-year old Filipino male from Bagamanoc, Catanduanes. He arrived from Cavite on June 24, 2020. He is asymptomatic and is quarantined at an LGU quarantine facility.
- Bicol#240 a 29-year old Filipino male from Legazpi City, Albay. He arrived from Manila on July 13, 2020. He is asymptomatic and is quarantined at an LGU quarantined facility.
- Bicol#241 a 22-year old Filipino female from Oas, Albay. She is a close contact of Bicol#222. She is asymptomatic and is quarantined.
- Bicol#242 a 32-year old Filipino male from Tabaco City, Albay. His history of exposure and travel is for verification. He is asymptomatic and is quarantined. Bicol#242 is a factory worker.
- Bicol#243 a 31-year old Filipino male from Manito, Albay. He arrived from Rizal on July 11, 2020. He first experienced symptoms on July 10, 2020. He is quarantined. Bicol#243 is a warehouse man.
- Bicol#244 a 32-year old Filipino male from Naga City, Camarines Sur. He is a close contact of Bicol#227. He first experienced symptoms on July 3, 2020. He is quarantined at an LGU quarantine facility, Bicol#244 is a bill collector.

Releasing of other details about the said patient is at the discretion of the Local Government Unit (LGU) concerned guided by the provisions of the Data Privacy Act.

Appeal to Public

COVID-19 confirmed cases in Bicol Region are increasing. The public especially the Locally Stranded Individuals (LSIs), Returning Overseas Falipinos (ROFs) and close contacts of confirmed COVID-19 cases must strictly follow quarantine and isolation procedures. Everyone must follow all the health protocols such as social distancing, use of facemask especially when outdoors, hand washing, cough etiquette, healthy lifestyle and to stay at home. Cooperation and discipline from the public are crucial at this time of crisis.

ERNIE V. VERA, MD, MPH, CHA, CESO IV

RNIE V. VERA, MD, MPH, CHA, CESO F Regional Director

On the 9 new cases, two (2) are from Aroroy, one (1) from Legazpi City, one (1) from Tabaco City, one (1) from Manito, one (1) from Oas, one (1) from Naga City, one (1) from Bagamanoc and one (1) from Matnog.

- Bicol#236 a 25-year old Filipino male from Aroroy, Masbate. He arrived from Tarlac on June 20, 2020. He is asymptomatic and is quarantined at an LGU quarantine facility.
- Bicol#237 a 5-year old Filipino male from Aroroy, Masbate. He arrived from Bulacan on June 21, 2020. He is asymptomatic and is quarantined at an LGU quarantine facility.
- Bicol#238 a 51-year old Filipino male from Matnog, Sorsogon. He arrived from Makati City on July 7, 2020. He first experienced symptoms on July 12, 2020. He is quarantined at am LGU quarantine facility.
- Bicol#239 –a 24-year old Filipino male from Bagamanoc, Catanduanes. He arrived from Cavite on June 24, 2020. He is asymptomatic and is quarantined at an LGU quarantine facility.
- Bicol#240 a 29-year old Filipino male from Legazpi City, Albay. He arrived from Manila on July 13, 2020. He is asymptomatic and is quarantined at an LGU quarantined facility.
- Bicol#241 a 22-year old Filipino female from Oas, Albay. She is a close contact of Bicol#222. She is
 asymptomatic and is quarantined.
- Bicol#242 a 32-year old Filipino male from Tabaco City, Albay. His history of exposure and travel is
 for verification. He is asymptomatic and is quarantined. Bicol#242 is a factory worker.
- Bicol#243 a 31-year old Filipino male from Manito, Albay. He arrived from Rizal on July 11, 2020. He first experienced symptoms on July 10, 2020. He is quarantined. Bicol#243 is a warehouse man.
- Bicol#244 a 32-year old Filipino male from Naga City, Camarines Sur. He is a close contact of Bicol#227. He first experienced symptoms on July 3, 2020. He is quarantined at an LGU quarantine facility. Bicol#244 is a bill collector.

Appeal to Public

COVID-19 confirmed cases in Bicol Region are increasing. The public especially the Locally Stranded Individuals (LSIs), Returning Overseas Filipinos (ROFs) and close contacts of confirmed COVID-19 cases must strictly follow quarantine and isolation procedures. Everyone must follow all the health protocols such as social distancing, use of facemask especially when outdoors, hand washing, cough etiquette, healthy lifestyle and to stay at home. Cooperation and discipline from the public are crucial at this time of crisis.



METHODOLOGY

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

people unlimited

Project Objective







METHODOLOGY

Questions to be Answered



Which LGUs are **most capable** of managing influx of COVID-19 positive LSIs?

Be KIND to address stigma during #coronavirus

222

Share the latest facts & avoid hyperbole



Show solidarity with affected people



Tell the stories of people who have experienced the virus

Which LGUs are **least capable** of managing influx of COVID-19 positive LSIs?

Be KIND to address fear during #coronavirus



Show empathy with those affected



Learn about the disease to assess the risks



Adopt practical measures to stay safe

Learn more to Be READY for #COVID19:

Learn more to Be READY for #COVID19: www.who.int/COVID-19



World Health Organization





6

CONCLUSION



METHODOLOGY

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

www.who.int/COVID-19





METHODOLOGY

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

CONCLUSION 7

Procurement Data Source





BACKGROUND

PHP1,577,000 2020-04-17 2020-04-24 Green Season Rice Mill & Grain Center

Procurement Of Relief Goods



PHP1,535,500 2020-04-15 __/Data/Files/Ac/15 2020-04-15 __/Data/Files/Ac/15 Local Government Unit Of Gamu, Isabela

Procurement Data Source



(20	HOME OPPC	RTUNITIES OPEN DATA	PBB 2019 HELP		REGISTER																	
¢	OPEN	I DATA																					
	C	Standard Re	eports and Datasets																				
		Registered	Suppliers				Clean	ing															
	GOVPH	DOF-BLGF ABOUT U	S - TRANSPARENCY CITIZEN	S CHARTER REGIONAL OFFICES TOO	LS ¥	Search		AREA REGION PROVINCE DIEL	D REC	COVEREUN	CLASSI CUN	MULAT GOWN_	GLOVES_/	HEADCOV	GOGGLES_ (OVERALIS	SHOECOV F	ACESHIEI S	JRGMAS N	95MASK HI	EAD_PPEB	DDY_PPEH/	AND_PP
	GOVERN					Phili Sunday, July	lippine Standard Time: y 19, 2020 8:22:26 PM	BACACAY REGION V ALBAY	0	1	2	3	6 25.75	6	1	6	6	13.5	41.25	31.25	93	12	25.75
	(SOZ)	DEPARTMENT OF						DARAGA (LREGION V ALBAY	0	8	6	14 48.2	5 2472.5	11.25	7.5	70	8.25	41.25	625	47.5	732.5	118.25	2472.5
	1987 1 35	BUREAU UF LUCA	L GOVERNMENT FINANCE					GUINOBA REGION V ALBAY	1	5	0	6	3 165	97.5	7	4	0	7	61	7	179.5	7	165
F	HOME / STATISTIC	CS				_		LEGAZH C REGION ALBAY	1	12	18	31 422.857	1 18805.14	881.9286	382.4286	489.4286	693.4286	219.5 1	3657.21 5	25.7143 1	5666.79 9	12.2857 1	8805.14
	STAT	ISTICS						LIGAO CIT REGION V ALBAY	0	1	3	4 103	5 184	119.1667	0	43.16667	103.3333 4	0.33333 6	394.333	100 6	653.833 1	46.6667	184
	• …							OAS REGION V ALBAY	0	0	1	1	0 100	20	5	16	0	10	10	0	45	16	100
	PUBLIC SECTOR FINANCIAL POSITION			ANNOUNCEM	ENTS		LABO REGION V CAMARINE	1	1	2	4 20.37	5 168.5	191.625	5.125	12.875	60.75	16	242.75	30.375	485.875	33.25	168.5	
								IRIGA CITY REGION V CAMARINE	0	1	0	1 54.1111	1 3722.222	1696.111	26.77778	36.66667	83.11111 4	8.77778 5	72.2222 1	35.1111	2479 9	0.77778 3	722.222
					Notice of Appoi	intments Issued		NAGA CITY REGION V CAMARINE	1	4	2	7 182.87	5 3131.813	1142.438	133.4375	143.875	448.625	268.625	2340	282.25	4166.75	326.75 3	131.813
	CONTRIBUT	TION OF LOCAL REVEN	NUE TO GDP		BLGF reminds let	ocal treasurers on	assessment of	TIGAON REGION V CAMARINE	0	2	1	3 17	5 200	0	17.5	0	10	7.5	0	0	25	17.5	200
R	tepublic of t	the Philippines	Department of	Budget and Manag	ement	Republic o	f the Philippines	MATNOG REGION V SORSOGO	0	1	0	1 2	0 300	8	0	9	1.5	100	500	1.5	609.5	29	300
	gp	pb	Government P	rocurement Polic	y Board	gpp	tso																
G	overnment Procu	arement Policy Board	rechnic	car support Office		Government Pro Technica	al Support Office	•															
wa	arded Co	ontracts				Pr	e-Proc	essing															
lome	e Market List	tings Awarded Contra	cts Project Requirements Procur	ring Entities 👻 Suppliers 👻 CSO Enrollm	ent Comments		+D Login																
ocuri	ing Entities wi	ith awarded contracts	Total Amount per Supplier Award	ded Contracts																			
varde	ed Contracts							•															
nan Gra	Project Name ade Disinfectant Solutio	Approved Budget on And Fac PHP108,864	Start Date End Date Name Of Awarded Co 2020-04-08 2020-04-18 Bauertek Corporation	Amount Awarded Date Of Award Notice Of PHP108,854 2020-04-02 _/Data/FB	Award Acceptance Da Contrat es/Ac/15 2020-04-08 /Data/File	es/Ac/11 /Data/Files/Ac/1	Procuring Endty																
curemen	nt Of Relief Goods	PHP686.000 :	020-04-16 2020-04-23 Tinars Dried Fish And Egg De 020-04-16 2020-04-23 Tinars Dried Fish And Egg De	PHP632.800 2020-04-16Data/File PHP632.800 2020-04-15Data/File	es/Ac/15 2020-04-16 ./Data/File	es/Ac/15_/Data/Files/Ac/1	15 Local Government Unit Of Gamu, Isat 15 Local Government Unit Of Gamu, Isat	xela xela															

BACKGROUND



RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

CONCLUSION 9

Procurement Data Processing Method [3]-[6]

Identification of LGU Attributes

Internal Revenue Allotment (IRA) (11, Input): This criterion pertains to the share of revenues an LGU will receive from the Philippine National Government.

Total Approved Budget Contract (ABC) (12, Input): This criterion pertains to the sum of ABCs of all COVID-19 related tenders made by an LGU.

Total Number of Contracts (13, Input): This criterion corresponds to the total number of COVID-19 related tenders made by an LGU.

Number of Active Cases (14, Input): This criterion corresponds to the total number of active COVID-19 cases reported per LGU as of June 14, 2020.

Approximate Number of COVID-19 Positive LSI (15, Input): This criterion corresponds to the estimated number of LSIs that are confirmed to be COVID-19 positive in each LGU.

Recovered (01, Output): This criterion corresponds to the total number of recovered COVID-19 patients for each LGU.

Total PPE (O2, Output): This criterion corresponds to the sum of all head, hand, shoe, and body PPE made available in hospitals for each LGU.

Total Bed (03, Output): This criterion corresponds to the sum of ICU units, isolation beds, bed wards, and mechanical vents dedicated for COVID-19 positive patients for each LGU.

Number of Hospital (04, Output): This criterion pertains to the total number of hospitals within the area of scope of each LGU.

Determination of LGU Capacity

Max
$$\phi + \varepsilon \cdot \left(\sum_{i=1}^{m} s_i^- + \sum_{r=1}^{s} s_r^+\right)$$

s.t.

$$\sum_{j=1}^{n} \lambda_j \cdot x_{ij} + s_i^- = x_{io}, \quad i = 1, \dots, m$$

$$\sum_{j=1}^{n} \lambda_j \cdot y_{rj} - s_r^+ = y_{ro} \cdot \phi, \quad r = 1, \dots, s$$

$$\sum_{j=1}^{n} \lambda_j = 1$$

$$\lambda_j \ge 0, \quad j = 1, \dots, m$$

$$s_i^- \ge 0, \quad i = 1, \dots, m$$

$$s_r^+ \ge 0, \quad r = 1, \dots, s$$

$$\phi \text{ free,} \qquad \varepsilon \ll 1$$

METHODOLOGY

Estimation of LSI Data



Cross-Examination of DOH-CHD Bicol Press Releases



Republic of the Philippines DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH CENTER FOR HEALTH DEVELOPMENT - BICOL

Bicol records 9 new cases of COVID-19 Press Release, July 16, 2020

The Department of Health Center for Health Development (DOH CHD) – Bicol records nine (9) new confirmed cases of COVID-19. The total number of COVID-19 cases recorded in Bicol Region is now two hundred fortyfour (244). Active cases are one hundred thirty-two (132).

On the 9 new cases, two (2) are from Aroroy, one (1) from Legazpi City, one (1) from Tabaco City, one (1) from Manito, one (1) from Oas, one (1) from Naga City, one (1) from Bagamanoc and one (1) from Matnog.

- Bicol#236 a 25-year old Filipino male from Aroroy, Masbate. He arrived from Tarlae on June 20, 2020. He is asymptomatic and is quarantimed at an LGU quarantine facility.
- Bicol#237 a 5-year old Filipino male from Aroroy, Masbate. He arrived from Bulacan on June 21, 2020. He is asymptomatic and is quarantined at an LGU quarantine facility.
- Bicol#238 a \$1-year old Filipino male from Matuog, Sorsogon. He arrived from Makati City on July 7, 2020. He first experienced symptoms on July 12, 2020. He is quarantined at an LGU quarantine facility.
- Bicol#239 –a 24-year old Filipino male from Bagamanoe, Catanduanes. He arrived from Cavite on June 24, 2020. He is asymptomatic and is quarantined at an LGU quarantine facility.
- Bicol#240 a 29-year old Filipino male from Legazpi City, Albay. He arrived from Manila on July 13, 2020. He is asymptomatic and is quarantined at an LGU quarantined facility.
- Bicol#241 a 22-year old Filipino female from Oas, Albay. She is a close contact of Bicol#222. She is asymptomatic and is quarantined.
- Bicol#242 a 32-year old Filipino male from Tabaco City, Albay. His history of exposure and travel is for verification. He is asymptomatic and is quarantined. Bicol#242 is a factory worker.
- Bicol#243 a 31-year old Filipino male from Manito, Albay. He arrived from Rizal on July 11, 2020. He first experienced symptoms on July 10, 2020. He is quarantined. Bicol#243 is a warehouse man.
- Bicol#244 a 32-year old Filipino male from Naga City, Camarines Sur. He is a close contact of Bicol#227. He first experienced symptoms on July 3, 2020. He is quarantined at an LGU quarantine facility. Bicol#244 is a bill collector.

Releasing of other details about the said patient is at the discretion of the Local Government Unit (LGU) concerned guided by the provisions of the Data Privacy Act.

Appeal to Public

COVID-19 confirmed cases in Bicol Region are increasing. The public especially the Locally Stranded Individuals (LSIs), Returning Overseas Filipinos (ROFs) and close contacts of confirmed COVID-19 cases must strictly follow quarantine and isolation procedures. Everyone must follow all the health protocols such as social distancing, use of facemask especially when outdoors, hand washing, cough etiquette, healthy lifestyle and to stay at home. Cooperation and discipline from the public are crucial at this time of crisis.

ERNIE V. VERA, MD, MPH, CHA, CESO IV **Regional Director**

METHODOLOGY

Approximate Number of LSI in Identified LGUs

BACKGROUND

Classification of COVID-19 Cases in Region V





Note: This visualization represents COVID-19 data as of June 14, 2020. This was purposely done to maintain consistency with the collected procurement data.

Estimated LSI Data for Region V



Note: This visualization represents extract LSI data as of July 8, 2020.

BACKGROUND

METHODOLOGY

Crucial LGU Attributes



Table 1. Ranking of LGU Attributes

Criterion Name	Criterion Code	Weight (Overall)	Overall Rank	Weight (Output)	Output Criterion Rank	Weight (Input)	Input Criterion Rank	
Recovered	01	0.1405	2 nd	0.3159	1 st	-	-	
Total PPE	02	0.1151	4 th	0.2587 2 nd		-	-	
Total Bed	O3	0.1090	5 th	0.2451	3 rd	-	-	
Number of Hospital	O4	0.0802	8 th	0.1803	4 th	-	-	
Internal Revenue Allotment	1	0.0765	9 th	-	-	0.1377	5 th	
Total Approved Budget Contract	12	0.0947	6 th	-	-	0.1706	3 rd	
Total Number of Contracts	13	0.0938	7 th	-	-	0.1689	4 th	
Number of Active Cases	4	0.1549	1 st	-	-	0.2790	1 st	
Approximate Number of COVID-19 Positive LSIs	15	0.1353	3 rd	-	-	0.2438	2 nd	

BACKGROUND

Capacity of LGUs in Region V to ACT on LSIs

High

High recovery rate

>3 hospitals in vicinity

Mod-High no. of LSIs

Mod-High no. active COVID-19 cases

Moderate

Low recovery rate

1-2 hospitals in vicinity

Low no. of LSIs

Low no. active COVID-19 cases

Low

Low recovery rate Mod-High no. of LSIs

1-2 hospitals in vicinity Mod-High no. active COVID-19 cases

Area	Province	Region	Resiliency Score	Resiliency Classification
Bacacay	Albay	Region V	0.8417	High
Daraga (Locsin)	Albay	Region V	0.8422	High
Guinobatan	Albay	Region V	0.8384	High
Legazpi City	Albay	Region V	0.8376	High
Ligao City	Albay	Region V	0.8453	High
Oas	Albay	Region V	0.5956	Moderate
Labo	Camarines Norte	Region V	0.8373	High
lriga City	Camarines Sur	Region V	0.8377	High
Naga City (Camarines Sur)	Camarines Sur	Region V	0.8368	High
Tigaon	Camarines Sur	Region V	0.8421	High
Matnog	Sorsogon	Region V	0.8374	High

Table A.1. List of LGUs and their Resiliency Scores

BACKGROUND

- It is suggested that LGUs who would fall under the classification of "Low" to limit the entry of LSIs into their area if the LGU do not have the capacity to immediately conduct COVID-19 tests on-site to these arriving individuals.
- It is also suggested that LGUs with resilience categorized as "Low" thoroughly review the implementation of their Annual Procurement Plan (APP). The greatest number of COVID-19 related tenders with ABCs observed to be significantly larger than that of "Moderate" and "High" groups were observed in these LGUs. This is. indicative of possible inefficiencies in the execution of the public procurement process and awarding of COVID-19 related tenders.
- To prevent further spread of COVID-19, LGUs classified as "Moderate" and "High" is strongly suggested to implement stringent health protocols while ensuring that arriving LSIs are not discriminated.

Conclusions

- As a long-term solution to sustain resiliency of the health system of an LGU, it is further suggested that those LGUs grouped as "Moderate" and "Low" invest heavily in their present health system to increase the number of hospitals located within their boundaries to at least three (3).
- Alongside this investment, it is also advised that **each hospital should have a total of at least 10,000 PPEs** to mitigate the impact of health system shocks induced by unwarranted surges in confirmed COVID-19 cases.

Conclusions



Acknowledgements









MS. FREI SANGIL, MSDS Chief Executive Officer Layertech Software Labs, Inc.

LAYERTECH LEARNING TEAM PH

METHODOLOGY



Acknowledgements



BICOL UNIVERSITY RESEARCH DEVELOPMENT AND EXTENSION OFFICE





BICOL UNIVERSITY COLLEGE OF ENGINEERING

CONCLUSION 19

Acknowledgements



FROM LEFT TO RIGHT: ENGR. PEE JAY GEALONE, ENGR. ARPON LUCERO, JR., ENGR. NICO ASPRA, ENGR. JOHN RAYMOND BARAJAS, ENGR. MARBEN RAMOS, ENGR. OLIVER PADUA

BACKGROUND

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION



ople unlimited

Thank you for listening!





BACKGROUND

METHODOLOGY



References

[1] <u>https://www.doh.gov.ph/covid19tracker</u>

[2] https://www.facebook.com/dohbicol/

[3] Zavadskas, E. K., & Podvezko, V. (2016, mar). Integrated determination of objective criteria weights in MCDM. International Journal of Information Technology and Decision Making, 15 (2), 267{283. doi:10.1142/S0219622016500036
[4] Santos, J., Pagsuyoin, S. A., & Latayan, J. (2016). A multi-criteria decision analysis framework for evaluating point-of-use water treatment alternatives. Clean Technologies and Environmental Policy, 18 (5), 1263-1279. doi: 10.1007/s10098-015-1066-y
[5] Pagsuyoin, S. A., Santos, J. R., Latayan, J. S., & Barajas, J. R. (2015, dec). A multi-attribute decision-making approach to the selection of point-of-use water treatment. Environment Systems and Decisions, 35 (4), 437-452. doi: 10.1007/s10669-015-9567-0
[6] Thanassoulis, E., Dey, P. K., Petridis, K., Goniadis, I., & Georgiou, A. C. (2017). Evaluating higher education teaching performance using combined analytic hierarchy process and data envelopment analysis. Journal of the Operational Research Society, 68(4), 431–445. https://doi:10.1057/s41274-016-0165-4

